

It's no fish ye're
allocating, it's men's lives*

Madeleine Hall-Arber
Stanford Fisheries Forum
September 2010

Apologies to Sir Walter Scott*

Management Goals/Vision

- Economic efficiency
- **Community stability**
- Community development
- Rebuilding stocks
- Bycatch mitigation
- **Ecosystem health and sustainability**
- Optimizing target catch
- **Stakeholder input and equity**
- Job growth
- Capacity building
- Capacity reduction



Building blocks of management

- Limited access system, then allocations of:
 - Days-at-sea (DAS)
 - Quota
 - Catch shares
 - Territorial Use Rights in Fisheries (TURFs)
 - Trap tags
 - Other
- Criteria for allocations:
 - Catch landings/history
 - Preservation of historic ports
 - Shoreside infrastructure
 - Conservation performance/goals
 - Equity
 - Management costs
 - Management certainty
 - Economic net benefits
 - Economic impacts
 - Enforcement
 - Jobs
 - Capacity
 - Opportunities for new entrants

N.E. groundfish allocations based on “history”

History=

- Quantity of fish landed
- Numbers of days a minimum amount was landed during a specified time period
- Briefly considered vessel size/capacity
- Briefly considered equal allocations



Implicit meaning of “history”

- Acknowledgement that individual's, company's or family's **financial** investment is important
 - Past performance (landings) should be the basis for continued access
- Rewarded are those who have landed the greatest quantities or spent the most time at sea
 - Most skilled and/or largest vessels? Greediest?

Understanding the implicit meanings behind the management criteria is critical to meeting management goals. The goals should reflect both national standards and stakeholders' values and/or vision of the future.



Data affects criteria and strategies

- Vessel owners allocated history; crewmembers not
 - Irrespective of their personal participation
- N.E. crewmembers are not tracked, nor are catch and crewmembers linked (unlike ships' logs in the 1800's)
- Crewmembers have no means to document their fishing history, so no basis for allocation
- Captains in Alaska's crab fishery were allocated a very small percentage of IFQ based on their personal participation history; now crews in Alaska are licensed so they can document their activity



Allocations and inequity

- Inshore fishermen, especially Downeast Maine, are disadvantaged due to the lack of cod during the relevant years—Should initial allocations be supplemented later?
- Severe trip limits on cod were in place during the selected time period for calculating history
- Some of the richest grounds were purposely chosen for closures (to reduce effort/mortality)
 - Inshore/small boat fishery disadvantaged
- DAS led to more inshore fishing and focus on schooling fish
- Those who fished on other species (to help recovery) lost access to groundfish

New England's Proudly Diverse Fleet

- Mobile and fixed gear
- Multitude of species
- Differences in scale
- Differences in practice
- Differences in ethnicity
- Differences in ages





Social Science to the rescue

- Interdisciplinary, participatory research is the key
 - Anthropology/sociology/political ecology consider the “back story”
 - Social and political context (e.g., community structure & dynamics)
 - Behavior patterns
 - Trends
 - Values
 - Adaptive strategies



Methodology

- Structured interviews
- Key-respondent interviews (semi-structured)
- Participant observation (fieldwork)
- Focus groups
- Oral histories

One challenge is proving that qualitative data are reliable; the other is knowing how to use the data for more effective management decisions.



Tools for weighing the data

- Models
 - Mapping—visualizing the geo-spatial context
 - Social networks
 - Well-being/happiness indicators
 - Cultural models
- Active participation of stakeholders
 - Collection of difficult to obtain data (e.g., LEK)
 - Groundtruthing
 - Collaboration (inclusion, leadership and vision)

Why should you care about values?

- Common goal:
Economic viability for
fleet and shoreside
infrastructure
- Definition of viability
differs according to
values:
 - Maximizing jobs
 - Maximizing wealth
 - Sustainability
 - Life style



Attitudes and values (e.g., equity) are not easily quantified, yet are important:
“[Father] taught us there was a right way to fish and a wrong way to fish.”

Avoiding unintended consequences



- Fishing practices
- “Way of life”
 - Family and women’s roles
- Community
- Waterfront access

Fishing practices

- Corporations and vertical integration
 - Outside investors (potentially foreign) unfamiliar with local values
 - Armchair fishermen
 - Safety concerns



Way of Life



The cost of permits—leasing or buying—
makes it difficult to “work your way up.”

Way of life

- We would go out, it would be 5, 6, 7 guys and we would be talking, telling jokes, playing cards. There was always 2 or 3 guys up constantly. Today, it's me and my son. If I am on watch, he is sleeping, or if he is on watch I am sleeping. You know, it is a whole different thing now to go fishing. I am beginning to hate it, for the first time in my life.



Waterfront access



“Just this summer. . .the charter boats, they moved to Hampton Beach because they sold the whole Newburyport waterfront, they’re going to build hotels and condominiums and everything else.”

“And if we don’t have a place to unload [the fish], then all our sacrifices are lost.”



Allocations rely on assessments

- Accurate assessments are necessary
 - Currently, not sufficiently fine-scaled
 - Not frequent enough
- Stock assessments rely on landings (in part)
 - Eliminating the network of small boats limits the information derived from multiple landings reflecting catches from a variety of sites



Future?

- Commercial fishing is the only source of fresh fish to eat for most people
- Diversity in the fleet has advantages, better mimics ecosystem processes

Acknowledgements

Photos:

Shareen Davis, Chatham, MA

Jimmy and Kathy Ruhle, Wanchese, North Carolina

Observations/comments:

Julia Olson, NMFS Fisheries

And those involved in groundfishing who have shared their stories. . .

